

# BULLETIN

Association canadienne des études patristiques (ACÉP)/

Canadian Society of Patristic Studies (CSPS)

---

volume XX numéro 1

avril 1996

---

**ACÉP RÉUNION / CSPS MEETING  
BROCK UNIVERSITY, ST. CATHARINES  
26-28 May 1996**

**SUNDAY 26 May**

9:15 - 9:30 President's Opening Remarks [Thistle 307]

9:30 - 10:30 **FIRST SESSION** [Thistle 307]  
Chair: Kevin Coyle

**Paul-Hubert Poirier**, Université Laval  
*Le philosophe, le chrétien et la mort: à propos de l'Ad Diognetum*

**Dilyl Patterson**, University of Ottawa  
*The Church as Mother in Visions 1-4 of The Shepherd of Hermas*

10:30 - 11:00 Break

11:00 - 12:30 **SECOND SESSION** [Thistle 307]

Discussion of Stephen Wilson's *Related Strangers: Jewish-Christian Relations 70-170* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1995)

Chair: Harry Maier  
**Stephen Wilson**, Carleton University  
**Lloyd Gaston**, Vancouver School of Theology  
**Paul-Hubert Poirier**, Université Laval

12:30 - 14:00 Lunch (Executive Meeting)

14:00 - 15:30 **THIRD SESSION** [Thistle 307]  
Chair: Daniel Sahas

**James Pope**, McMaster University  
*The Place of Demonology in Origen's Thought*

**Peter Widdicombe**, McMaster University  
*Athanasius' Images of Generation*

**John Egan**, Regis College  
*Gregory Nazianzen's Variable Use of the Term "Cause" in His Trinitarian Theology: Is this Use Arbitrary?*

15:30 - 16:00 Break

16:00 - 17:00 FOURTH SESSION [Thistle 307]

Chair: John Egan

**Andrius Valevicius**, Université de Sherbrooke  
*John Chrysostom and Private Property*

**Eleanor Irwin**, Scarborough College, University of Toronto  
*City Tumult, Country Peace: Basil on His Pontic Retreat*

17:00 - 18:00 Executive Meeting

Departure for Vineland Estates Winery (Banquet)

## **MONDAY 27 May**

10:30 - 12:00 Executive Meeting

12:00 - 13:00 Special Meeting of CSSR/SCER

13:00 - 15:00 CSPS/ACEP Annual General Meeting [Thistle 307]  
Visit by Representative of the HSSFC/FCSHS

15:00 - 15:30 Break

15:30 - 17:00 FIFTH SESSION [Thistle 307]  
With CAECS/ACEOC

Chair: TBA

**Patrick Gray**, York University  
*Athanasius as Martyr and as the Teacher of Monks: Two Topoi Used in His Patrifaction*

**Stéphane Bigham**, Université de Saint Paul  
*Les écrits iconophobes d'Epiphane de Salamine: vrais ou faux?*

**Daniel Sahas**, University of Waterloo  
*The Patristic and Non-Patristic Character of the Confutatio Hagareni of Bartholomeus of Edessa (9th c.?)*

17:00 - 19:00 CSPS/ACEP Reception [After Hours/Courtyard]

20:00 - 22:00 Joint Lecture with CSSR/SCER and CSBS/SCEB,  
followed by Reception [Locations TBA]

**Grace Jantzen**, University of Manchester  
*Who Counts as a Mystic? Power, Gender and Ecstasy*

**TUESDAY 28 May**

9:00 - 10:00 SIXTH SESSION [Thistle 307]  
Chair: Patrick Gray

**Mark Vessey**, University of British Columbia  
*Jerome and Rufinus in Literary History*

**Lisa Coulthard**, University of Toronto  
*"The Sickly Taste of Married Women": Desire, Violence and the  
Grotesque Female Body in Jerome*

10:00 - 10:30 Break

*C. Koenigsmeyer, "The Actman Understanding of Scripture"*

10:30 - 12:00 SEVENTH SESSION [Thistle 307]  
Chair: Peter Widdicombe

CSPS/ACEP ESSAY PRIZE WINNER

**Robert Tees**, McMaster University  
*Modalist or Trinitarian? The Intra-Divine Relations in Books  
I-IV of Augustine's The Trinity*

**Constance McLeese**, Concordia University  
*Augustine's De sancta virginitate: A Theology of Equality through  
Humility*

**Kevin Coyle**, Saint Paul University  
*The Manichean Jesus according to Augustine of Hippo*

12:00 - 13:00 Lunch (Executive Meeting)

13:15 - 14:45 EIGHTH SESSION [Education 209]  
With CSM/SCM and CSRS/SCER

*Augustine and Augustinianisms 400-1700*  
*Augustin et les augustinismes 400-1700*

**Walter Hannam**, Dalhousie University  
*Nodo unitatis et caritatis: The Structure and Unity of St.  
Augustine's De Doctrina Christiana*

**Teresa Pierre**, University of Toronto  
*The Body of Evidence: New Interpretations of Augustine's  
Anthropology*

**Daniel Pourchot**, Université de Montréal  
*Le patrimoine augustinien dans la Réforme luthérienne*

14:45 - 15:00 Break

15:00 - 16:45 NINTH SESSION [as above - continued]

**Catherine Conybeare**, University of Toronto  
*Augustine and the Opacity of Language*

**Ian McAdam**, University of Lethbridge  
*The Augustinian Background of Dr. Faustus and The Tempest*

**James Dale**, McMaster University  
*Augustine and Donne: The Confessions and the Divine Poems*

17:00 - 19:00 President's Reception [New Residence Dining Hall]

---

## ABSTRACTS

**Lisa COULTHARD**

*'The Sickly Taste of Married Women': Desire, Violence and the Grotesque Female Body in Jerome*

In his *Letter 22 to Eustochium*, Jerome dwells momentarily upon the coming of Christ into this world: "Nine month he awaits his birth in the womb, undergoes the most revolting conditions, and comes forth covered in blood, to be swathed in rags and covered with caresses." The womb is here imagined as a prison, as a disgusting place of blood and filth, only to be escaped in birth. The focus on blood, filth and the womb in this passage can be related to a wider insistence on bodies, especially women's bodies, in Jerome's correspondence. The female body in Jerome is often imagined as a site of the grotesque, a place of viscerality, mutability, infection and irregularity. Jerome is not unique in this respect. Indeed, as Mary Russo points out in her book *The Female Grotesque*, the identification of the female body with the "grotesque" is implied in the very definition of that word: "The word itself . . . evokes the cave -- the grotto-esque. Low, hidden, earthly, dark, material, immanent, visceral. As bodily metaphor, the grotesque cave tends to look like (and in the most gross metaphorical sense be identified with) the cavernous anatomical female body." In this paper I want to consider the operations of violence and desire in the depiction and simultaneous regulation, discipline and control of the grotesque female body in Jerome.

**Catherine CONYBEARE**

*Augustine and the Opacity of Language*

Why is the Latinity of the *Confessions* so idiosyncratic? Why does Augustine, who elsewhere writes measured rhetorical clausulae, here essay a jagged, often contorted style? This paper claims that the change of style is a deliberate and considered move to force the reader or listener to concentrate on the opaque properties of language: human language obscures our search for our true object, God; we must instead trust to inner contemplation to find Him. Evidence for this attitude is taken from the *Confessions* themselves and from the discussion of the nature and status of communication in the *De Magistro*.

Kevin COYLE

*The Manichaean Jesus according to Augustine of Hippo*

Ever since De Beausobre in the 1730s, voices have been raised to cast in doubt Augustine's reports on his former religion. The classic instance is the impugning of Manichaean morals; but the question of veracity has also spilled over to doctrine, including the Jesus of Manichaeism. I propose briefly to review the discussion of Augustine's presentation of Manichaean christology, then examine Augustine's picture itself, especially in terms of the Manichaean documents themselves. ✓

John EGAN

*Gregory Nazianzen's Variable Use of the Term 'Cause' in His Trinitarian Theology: Is this Use Arbitrary?*

E. P. Meijering asserts that Gregory Nazianzen can maintain his position on causal superiority within the Trinity only by making arbitrary uses of the term "cause". My intention in this communication is to analyze selected texts of Gregory with a view to responding to Meijering's position.

Patrick GRAY

*Athanasius as Martyr and as Teacher of Monks: Two Topoi Used in His Patrification*

Referred to as the "star of Alexandria" by the Sixth Century, and understood to be an essential "father" of the Church—someone, that is, whose writings could be used as a standard of doctrinal orthodoxy—, Athanasius himself was unfamiliar with that very notion, and certainly possessed no such status in his own time. Patrification, the process by which a person came to be construed as a father by posterity, was an historical development which can be charted to some extent from the evidence.

In the case of Athanasius, the process of patrification was helped along considerably by the association of his memory with two groups of heroes: the old heroes from the age of persecution, the confessors and martyrs; and the new heroes who took their place in the Church's imagination, the monks.

In the first case, it is possible to trace the development of a topos in accounts of Athanasius, a topos which construes his sufferings at the hands of Arian heretics, and even more his fearless championing of the Nicene cause, as a kind of bold confessing of, and/or witnessing to, the Christian faith. He is described variously as an athlete for Christ, a confessor, and a martyr. This rhetoric accomplishes several things: it forms part of the developing orthodox strategy of demonizing the Arian option as non-Christian, making it no better than the pagan religions that lay behind the persecutions; more importantly for our purposes, it confers on Athanasius' theology, as the faith of a martyr, an authority analogous to that which was acquired by an Ignatius of Antioch or a Polycarp in the Second Century. Like them, as a sufferer for "the truth", Athanasius is seen as necessarily on the side of the truth since he is persecuted by the champions of untruth. The rhetoric makes it possible to forget too that, unlike them, Athanasius was not killed for his beliefs.

In the second case, Athanasius' association with the emerging monastic movement in Egypt in both its coenobitic and its anchoritic forms—an association he actively fosters in writing the *Life of Antony*, and which is perpetuated and developed in both East and West—serves in a different way to enhance his authority as a theologian. Athanasius is never construed as actually being a

monk, but rather the clue is taken from his own rhetoric in the *Life*: he is a man who bore the burden of the secular life as patriarch, despite his personal preference for the monastic life, so that he could act in his episcopal capacity as a theological guide to the monks. Many stories in the monastic literature stress at the same time the perils of this secular life for Athanasius as a person (the monastic writer is never in doubt that he and his brothers have chosen the better part!) and the invaluable function he served for the monks in being able to steer them on a safe orthodox path through the turbulent waters of Fourth-Century theological controversy.

While not central in the process of Athanasius' patrification, these developments conspired with other, more important developments, to ensure his unquestioned status among the "church fathers."

Walter HANNAM

Nodo unitatis et caritatis: *The Structure and Argument of St. Augustine's De Doctrina Christiana*

Much work has been done, of late, to explain the historical background of (and the intellectual motivation for) Augustine's completion of the *De Doctrina Christiana*. The question arises from this research, however, as to the unity of Augustine's thought in the work as a whole: are the later additions to the treatise merely convenient addenda employed to complete an unfinished work, yet entailing a new system of thought foreign to the thought of the younger Augustine? Or, on the other hand, does the *De Doctrina Christiana* constitute a complete and unified philosophical argument from beginning to end? This paper will endeavour to show that Augustine's treatise on Christian instruction presents not only a unified hermeneutic, but also a comprehensive and profoundly Trinitarian understanding of the place of Scripture and its interpretation in the Church as a whole.

Eleanor IRWIN

*City Tumult, Country Peace: Basil on His Pontic Retreat*

Although Basil spent many years in his youth and much of his later life in the church in cities, he chose to live away from the city in a remote part of Pontus on the Iris river in his middle period and whenever he could. I will investigate what this meant in terms of what Basil valued and needed for himself especially as he revealed it in his correspondence with his friend Gregory. I will also look at the implications for the Christian church in the values of city and country reflected in his writings.

Constance McLEESE

*Augustine's De Sancta Virginitate: A Theology of Equality through Humility*

Recently the Christian value of humility has come under severe criticism, particularly by post-Christian feminists such as Mary Daly. This paper proposes to analyze the rhetorical structure of Augustine's most complete development of his theology of humility as it is found in the last twenty-five chapters of the *De Sancta Virginitate*. This exegesis will illustrate that humility is the Christian attitude par excellence for Augustine. Not only a virtue to be promoted, Augustinian humility is the foundation of the incarnation and of Christian salvation. Furthermore, humility as cultivated within the Augustinian paradigm should not promote sexism but rather diminish it.

**Dilys PATTERSON**

*The Church as Mother in Visions 1-4 of The Shepherd of Hermas*

The second-century document, *The Shepherd of Hermas*, uses maternal imagery in the oldest layer of the text, Visions 1-4. Visions 1-4 present the church as an elderly woman whose appearance changes in response to the growing spiritual maturity of Hermas, the story's main character. In this text, the Mediterranean cultural values of honour and shame play an essential role in the construction of the symbol of the Church as Mother. The symbol of the Church as Mother rests primarily upon the instruction in moral goodness which Mother Church provides to her children. Since Mother Church "was created the first of all things" (Vis. 4.1.1), she becomes the major agent of salvation in Visions 1-4. The components of this symbol, as presented in *The Shepherd of Hermas*, indicate that the understanding of the Church was more complex in second-century Christianity than the image of the Church which is portrayed in the New Testament.

**Paul-Hubert POIRIER**

*Le philosophe, le chrétien et la mort: à propos de l'Ad Diognetum*

Dans son commentaire de *l'Ad Diognetum* (Paris, 1951 & 1965), H. I. Marrou a beaucoup insisté sur l'originalité dont ferait preuve l'auteur de cet opuscule dans sa manière de décrire la situation paradoxale des chrétiens dans le monde (chap. 5-6). Cependant, derrière l'indéniable originalité formelle et un ton irénique, se cachent des visées polémiques dont la prise en compte est nécessaire pour bien comprendre le dessein de l'auteur. Ayant analysé ailleurs sa critique du judaïsme (cf. *Vigiliae christianae* 40, 1986, 218-225), nous considérerons ici la reprise polémique qu'il fait du thème, connu depuis au moins Platon, du suicide ou de la mort volontaire du philosophe.

**J. C. POPE**

*The Place of Demonology in Origen's Thought*

To date no comprehensive treatment of Origen's demonology has appeared. This paper will begin to redress this oversight by surveying the nature of demonology not only in Origen's well known works *Peri Archôn* and *Contra Celsum*, but also in the full range of his works, including his numerous homilies and commentaries. Passages illustrating the role that demonology plays in Origen's doctrine of God, his soteriology, his thoughts regarding free will and his use of philosophy will be examined. The conclusions will help to answer the question whether demonology can be ignored or removed from Origen's thought without detracting from what he considered both unique to and attractive about Christianity.

**Daniel SAHAS**

*The Patristic and Non-Patristic Character of the Confutatio Hagareni of Bartholomeus of Edessa (9th c.?)*

The Byzantine anti-Islamic literature, as all polemic literature for that matter, does not claim to be a specimen of finesse and civility; the *Confutatio Hagareni* (PG 104: 1384-1448) competes for primacy in this respect. And yet this little known treatise, attributed to an elusive monk from Edessa, and in the midst of hyperbole, vulgarities and insults, contains a wealth of attractive

textual, historical, theological, cultural, and comparative information, not to mention phenomenological characteristics of Christianity and ninth-century Islam in Syria. The focus of this paper will be twofold: a) those issues which refer or allude to the state of theology at the time and in the context of this Edessene writer, particularly to the way in which his thought, words and arguments compare to other controversialists like John of Damascus, and b) the state of the ascetic community and its ethos in relationship to the development of Islamic sufism. More often than not, in texts not so "Patristic" even though in the *Patrologia*, a certain Patristic ethos and thought transpire which may be inviting us to broaden the concept of "Patristic" literature. Bartholomaeus may be one of them.

**Andrius VALEVICIUS**

#### John Chrysostom and Private Property

This may seem like a topic that has already been written about, and so it is. After scholarship of the 1930s presented John as a staunch defender of the right of ownership, more recent readings would like to see in him the true Christian communist for whom private property is a grave sin. Yet this great preacher was friend to many a rich widow, as well as to the common people. So which is the right interpretation?

**Mark VESSEY**

#### *Jerome and Rufinus in Literary History*

An account of the careers and achievement of these two Latin writers, destined for the *Cambridge History of Early Christian Literature*.

**Peter WIDDICOMBE**

#### *Athanasius' Images of Generation*

The primary images that Athanasius uses to describe the generation of the Son from the Father are those of "Father" and "Son" themselves. But he uses a number of other images as well. This paper will examine the relation in Athanasius' thought between these two primary images and other less prominent ones.

---

## ACÉP/CSPS CONCOURS D'ESSAI 1996

Six essais ont été soumis cette année, deux d'entre eux étaient rédigés en français, quatre en anglais. Comme on peut s'y attendre dans ce genre de concours, les essais couvraient un large spectre de sujets, allant de la théologie trinitaire à l'anthropologie chrétienne primitive en rapport avec les politiques actuelles de l'Église romaine à l'égard des femmes. Ces essais adoptaient également une large variété d'approches, certaines plus théologiques, d'autres plus historiques. Dans un tel contexte, le choix du meilleur essai ne constitue pas une tâche facile. Les critères retenus ont porté sur la matière (rigueur de l'argumentation, qualité de l'information, discussion

critique des sources) et sur la forme (cohérence et clarté, qualité de la langue et du style).

Sur cette base, l'essai soumis par Robert Tees dans le cadre du concours d'essai 1996 de l'ACÉP/CSPS, "Modalist or Trinitarian? The Intra-Divine Relations in Books I-IV of Augustine's *The Trinity*" est déclaré gagnant. Cet essai est excellent, très bien écrit et d'une lecture agréable. Il remet en question de façon convaincante ce qui semble être devenu un lieu commun dans la théologie systématique contemporaine, il fournit à son lecteur une problématique claire et une argumentation solide. Pour autant qu'on puisse en juger, le travail est bien informé (on peut toutefois se demander s'il n'existe pas quelque étude pertinente dans des langues autres que l'anglais, spécialement en français ou en allemand). La discussion des textes d'Augustin dans leur langue originale eût rehaussé la qualité de l'ensemble.

---

## RIDE TO CSPS AND TO NAPS

I will be travelling by car from Sherbrooke, P.Q. to Hamilton, ONT. on Saturday, May 25. I will then go by car to Chicago on Wednesday, May 29 from Hamilton. I will be returning to Hamilton on Sunday, June 2 and then continue to Montreal and Sherbrooke, P.Q. on Monday, June 3. So far I have an empty car and would be glad to take on some passengers. If interested please call off. (819) 821-7607 or res. (819) 842-4179 or E-mail a.valevi@courrier.Usherb.ca. The mailing address is: Faculté de théologie, Université de Sherbrooke, Sherbrooke, P.Q. J1K 2R1.

"Andrius Valevicius"

---

## CHANGES OF ADDRESS/NEW ADDRESSES

### **Brown, Joanne Carlson**

*Home address:*

514 11th St.E.  
Saskatoon, SA S7N 0G2

### **Haykin, Michael A.G.**

34 Thornton Trail  
Dundas, ON L9H 6Y2

### **Coulthard, Lisa**

17 Dearbourne Avenue  
Toronto, ON M4K 1M6  
(416) 469-2365  
coulthar@epas.utoronto.ca

### **Helleman, Wendy E.**

102542.2146@compuserve.com  
*Contact address:*  
c/o J. Van Meggelin  
516 Soudan Avenue  
Toronto, ON M4S 1X3

### **Foley, Donna M.**

dmfoley@delta.uwindsor.ca

### **Tees, Robert**

103 — 18 Dundas Street  
Dundas, ON L9H 6H3

### **Gray, Patrick**

pgray@yorku.ca

## NEW MEMBERS

**Tees, Robert** Department of Religious Studies, McMaster

**Haykin, Michael A.G.** Retired

---

## RÉUNION ANNUELLE/ANNUAL MEETING

Le samedi, 3 juin 1995  
Université du Québec à Montréal.

### 1. Procès-verbal de l'assemblée générale du 5 juin 1994

Le procès-verbal est approuvé sans modification, tel qu'il avait été publié dans le *Bulletin* d'avril 1995.

### 2. President's Report:

P.-H. Poirier extended thanks to executive members for their work on this year's programme. On the completion of his second term as president, he noted that he had enjoyed his time throughout, and thanked members for their support.

### 3. Secretary and Bulletin-Editor's Report:

- P. Gray reported that the Brochure seemed to be bringing in new members and that Directories past and present had been sent to the National Library.
- There was discussion of a request from Osborne Publishing for permission to use the CSPS mailing-list. It was agreed that permission should not be granted.

### 4. Treasurer's Report:

- In re the Financial Statement for 1994, K. Coyle pointed out that the deposit at the Calgary restaurant had finally been returned, and that not all expenses occurred every year. He indicated that he would want to raise again in future the question of auditing, which occasioned significant expense every two years, but which was required by SSHRCC.
- In re the Interim Financial Report for 1995, K. Coyle informed members of the impending end of the SSHRCC administrative Grant as SSHRCC confronted its cuts in funding. He indicated that travel grants were to continue, but that CSPS would have to be successful in the competition for these. There were preliminary discussions of several matters: strategies for dealing with a reduced budget, including the notion of distributing the *Bulletin* by E-mail only, and of raising dues; the possibility of withdrawing from CFH once it is no longer possessed of SSHRCC funds to distribute.
- The following motion was passed unanimously: That the executive be empowered to undertake cost-cutting measures and to raise fees if necessary. (Irwin/de Bruyn)

### 5. Report of the Nominating Committee:

The following slate was proposed:

President	H. Maier
Vice-President	L. Painchaud
Programme Committee	P. Widdicombe
Nominating Committee	M. Desjardins (2-year term)

J. McWilliam (3-year term)  
Rep. to CCSR AGM P. Rigby  
M. Desjardins

A motion was passed to approve the slate. (Gray/Remus)

6. Planning for the 1996 Learned's:

- Members were brought up to date on planning, including locale (Brock University in St. Catherine's); dates (May 26-28); and a proposed joint session with the Canadian Association of Eastern Christian Studies (date undetermined at this point).
- Concern was expressed by some members about the effect of joint sessions on the amount of time available to members for regular papers.
- The issue of a joint session with the Jews/Christians/Pagans Seminar was raised. The Programme Committee was asked to check with Terry Donaldson of Saskatoon about the dates and times.
- There was a suggestion that graduate student papers be scheduled for the last day, with the next day being reserved for the joint session with CAECS and the J/C/P Seminar.
- P. Widdicombe of McMaster agreed to act as Local Representative.

7. Student Essay Prize:

- P. Gray reported that the contest had been a success, with the winning essay being Laurie Richardson's *Charity in the Word: Augustine and Christian Rhetoric*. He noted that the evaluation procedure was being refined for the future, so that students could have detailed evaluation of their submissions. For 1996 the date for submission will be Jan. 15, to allow more time for evaluation.

8. Report on AIEP, NAPS, and the Oxford Conference:

- K. Coyle reported that AIEP (Association Internationale des Etudes Patristiques) had published a very successful Brochure, which had been well received in English-language countries; he also noted that AIEP would have a presence at the Oxford Conference.
- The executive outlined plans for a reception at the Oxford conference in honour of CSPS' Twentieth Anniversary, and noted that P.-H. Poirier had been invited to give one of the more prestigious lectures as another way of marking the occasion.
- K. Coyle reported on exploratory discussions with NAPS (North American Patristic Society) about building friendly relations, seeking closer collaboration, and about the possibility of establishing an arrangement whereby NAPS members could give papers at CSPS conferences in Oxford years, when NAPS does not meet.

9. Visit from Craig McNaughton of CFH:

- Representing CFH (Canadian Federation for the Humanities), Mr. McNaughton informed members of the financial crisis imposed on SSHRCC by government cuts of 14% to the SSHRCC budget over the next three years. Since CFH administers money from SSHRCC for the support of the Learned's, and the activities of member societies such as CSPS, this crisis has direct implications for us. Mr. McNaughton indicated that lengthy discussions had led to a decision to merge CFH with the sister federation for the social sciences (CFSS). He indicated that societies in the humanities might face problems in having their concerns addressed since they were fewer in numbers than the social scientists, and tended to be split up into many small societies, whereas there are fewer but larger societies in CFSS.

10. Adjournment:

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

## NOUVELLES DE NOS MEMBRES

Robert Tees, winner of this year's Essay Prize, is working on an M.A. in Religious Studies under the supervision of Peter Widdicombe. His thesis is a critical assessment of Wolfhart Pannenberg's trinitarian doctrine of God, with special attention to his proposed modification of the patristic notion of the inner-trinitarian relations as relations of origin, in which Pannenberg rejects as unbiblical and subordinationist the patristic notion of God the Father as origin and source of divinity in favour of a conception of the divine ontology as comprised of relations of reciprocal self-distinction. Tees argues (we shall hear some of this argument in the presentation at Brock) that Pannenberg's critique of the patristic understanding is misguided, and that it seriously misrepresents Augustine.

---

### FROM OUR RUSSIAN CORRESPONDENT

*The following was received by Email from Wendy Helleman, now teaching in Moscow State University.*

Dear friends and colleagues of the ACEP/CSPS in Canada:

When we came to Moscow last fall I was particularly looking forward to discovering the status of scholarly work on patristics here. One of the main questions in my mind was whether scholarly work in patristics would be associated with the study of classical languages and literature, as it is at many European universities, or whether, more like North America, it would depend for its survival on the interest and intentions of people of much more varied specializations. I was in for several surprises.

To begin with, I quickly discovered that the question itself, as posed, was not understood. Study of the "patres" is a field which is very close to the heart of the Orthodox faith, as it appreciates longstanding tradition in some ways even more strongly than within Catholicism. As a result, even Christian saints and martyrs of the past century can be included in the term "church fathers."

The next hurdle was to understand the impact of the decades of atheistic communism. Moscow State University, where we teach, was established in the Eighteenth Century with a strong classics faculty at its core. Theology, too, was at the heart of the curriculum before the Revolution. Both faculties disappeared shortly afterwards; theology and patristics, and even the study of the classical languages and literature, were regarded as non-subjects, a holdover from superstitions of the past. Classics was reestablished at the time of the second world war, but theological studies had a very tenuous existence under the watchful eyes of the communist ideological "think tank" which was headquartered on the tenth floor of the "Humanitarian" building in which we now teach, the very floor which housed the philological faculty as well. The philosophy faculty, which all through the communist decades was held responsible to watch over the Marxist-Leninist "political correctness" of those days, is still located just above, on the eleventh floor. Even so, we have heard stories of professors holding classes in the halls, when denied classroom space, teaching the Fathers and works of the Christian philosophers under the very noses of the watchdogs.

All of this is now, happily, a matter of history. Restriction on publishing or the use of books is virtually eliminated; classroom space is only limited by availability of furniture and fixtures in good repair, and classes held today are far more influenced by the presence (or absence) of students overworked by the necessity of earning extra money to supplement their very meagre "stipendium" or scholarship. But there are other factors slowing down a return to stability. The older universities

especially have witnessed a considerable brain drain; many qualified teachers, dismayed at the slow pace of such institutions at doing the necessary "house-cleaning", have left to work in new universities which have sprung up, many of them funded with private monies. Many others left Russia to work elsewhere.

How does this impact scholarly work in patristics? To the extent that I am able to understand the situation, my impression is that its state is very much in flux. The teaching and study of patristics, where reestablished and given serious attention, is probably at least as limited and dispersed as in North America. It has a presence at Moscow State University, one that is scattered through various faculties like philosophy, history, and classical philology; it is more decidedly part of the curriculum of Orthodox theological and academic institutions.

The teaching of patristics, as it is understood here, could function as a vital ingredient in the reestablishment of the Orthodox faith as a public and political movement; and whether or not it will be realized, the Orthodox hierarchy makes no secret of working towards recognition as state church. There is significant potential, thus, for the study of patristics to become popularized far beyond the walls of higher academic establishments. At present patristics, as a field of study, is perhaps still most "at home" in the seminaries, a part of training for the priesthood. But, just as in North American seminaries, these schools have a practical goal of preparing men for parish work. So study of patristics, as a study of earlier fathers, cannot expect full scholarly treatment in such a context, even though serious work is done on the ancient languages: Greek, Hebrew, and Latin. Noteworthy among newly established universities is the Orthodox University which was established a few years ago to rival Moscow State University (on a much smaller scale) as a serious academic institution. Even so, among colleagues who have taught at both, there are still those who would opt to continue teaching at Moscow State, testifying to the appreciable openness to current academic freedom to pursue scholarly work at Russia's premier University, a good reason not to make a complete move.

Not that this university is without its problems: drastically reduced salaries resulting from inflation, a brain drain of unimaginable proportions, etc. etc. At Moscow State I have so far made contact mainly with professors in history of philosophy and in classics, both young and old. Our immediate colleagues are professors of English language, teaching students in philosophy. And I am happy to say that they have encouraged me in my current project, the course I have developed on "lives of the philosophers" of antiquity, a course with subject matter which crosses a number of boundaries, for it begins by looking at lives of Socrates and Pythagoras, then moves on to Porphyry's life of Plotinus, and finally compares these with lives of two Christian leaders, Antony (Athanasius' life) and (Gregory of Nyssa's life of) Macrina. This kind of a course seems to be relatively well accepted by my students, who are second and third year philosophy students taking English as a second language. And so our colleagues have asked me to write it up with a manual which can be used again in future as a base course to offer to philosophy students.

Although I have certainly discovered the unique character of the study of patristics here in Russia, my quest for understanding is by no means finished. We are working hard to get a basic command of the Russian language, and hope that our stay over the summer here will give us the time we need to pursue some of the contacts and explore libraries and new academic institutions. But we are still in touch with North American colleagues via Email. Please note our current [address—see above.]

The *Bulletin* is published twice each year, in April and in November, by the Association Canadienne des Etudes Patristiques/Canadian Society of Patristic Studies, and distributed to members of the Society and other interested parties.

Contributions in the form of reports (like Wendy Helleman's in this issue), new information on research and other scholarly activities in patristics, and corrections of address etc. are always welcome.

Please address all correspondence to the editor:

Professor Patrick Gray  
Humanities, Atkinson  
York University  
4700 Keele Street  
North York, ON M3J 1P3